



UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA PRESS
Advancing Knowledge, Driving Change

The Myth of the "Biogenetic Law"

Author(s): Brian Freeman

Source: *The American Biology Teacher*, Feb., 2001, Vol. 63, No. 2 (Feb., 2001), p. 84

Published by: University of California Press on behalf of the National Association of Biology Teachers

Stable URL: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/4451046>

REFERENCES

Linked references are available on JSTOR for this article:

https://www.jstor.org/stable/4451046?seq=1&cid=pdf-reference#references_tab_contents

You may need to log in to JSTOR to access the linked references.

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <https://about.jstor.org/terms>



National Association of Biology Teachers and University of California Press are collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The American Biology Teacher*

JSTOR

NABT BOARD OF DIRECTORS

President: Ann S. Lumsden, Dept. of Biological Sciences, Florida State University, Tallahassee, FL 32306
President-Elect: Brad Williamson, 2619 W. 131 St., Olathe, KS 66061-5955
Past President: Philip J. McCrea, New Trier H.S., 385 Winnetka Ave., Winnetka, IL 60093
Secretary/Treasurer: Toby Horn, Fralin Biotechnology Center, West Campus Dr., Virginia Tech, Blacksburg, VA 24061-0346
Director at Large: Bob Melton, Putnam City Schools, 56401 NW 40th, Oklahoma City, OK 73122
Director at Large: Ann Haley MacKenzie, Miami University, 301 McGuffey Hall, Oxford, OH 45056
Director/Coordinator: Robert J. Malyk, Ridley College, P.O. Box 3013, #2 Ridley Rd., St. Catharines, Ontario, Canada L2R 7C3

COMMITTEE CHAIRS

Awards Committee: Phil Poppleton, 43326 236th Ave., S.E., Enumclaw, WA 98022
Constitution & Bylaws Committee: Elizabeth Carvellas, 93 Wilderness Rise Rd., Colchester, VT 05446
Professional Development/Education Committee: Susan Phillips Speece, Fresno City College, 1101 E. University Ave., Fresno, CA 93741 and Marsha Matyas, American Physiological Society, 9650 Rockville Pike, Bethesda, MD 20814-3991
Election Teller: Edward L. Frazier, 5007 W. 14th St., Speedway, IN 46224-6503
Honorary Membership Committee: Brad Williamson, 2619 W. 131 St., Olathe, KS 66061-5955
International Activities Committee: Jennifer Huntsberger, 1029 Hickory Dr., Las Cruces, NM 88005
Long Range Planning Committee: Phil McCrea, New Trier H.S., 385 Winnetka Ave., Winnetka, IL 60093
Nominating Committee: Elizabeth Carvellas, 93 Wilderness Rise Rd., Colchester, VT 05446
Publications Committee: Bob Melton, Putnam City Schools, 5401 NW 40th, Oklahoma City 73122
Technology Task Force: Betsy Ott, Tyler Junior College, 1400 East Fifth St., Tyler, TX 75711

SECTION CHAIRS

Elementary/Middle School Section: Gerard Wenzel, 1806 7th Ave. NW, East Grand Forks, MN 56721
Four-Year College Biology Teachers Section: Donald French, Oklahoma State University, Dept. of Zoology, 430 LSW, Stillwater, OK 74708-3052
Multicultural Affairs Section: Pamela Harrell, 905 Crest View, Bedford, TX 76021
Role & Status of Women in Biology Education: Linda S. Samuels, The Science of Learning Center, 1148 Boylston St., Chestnut Hill, MA 02467
Two-Year College Biology Section: Pam Clarke, Red Deer College, Box 5005, Red Deer, Alberta, Canada T4N 5H5
Retired Members Section: Nancy Van Vranken, Teachers Clearinghouse, Box 264, Jericho, NY 11753

REGIONAL COORDINATORS

Region I (CT, ME, MA, NH, RI, VT): Susan Plati, Brookline H.S., 115 Greenough St., Brookline, MA 02146
Region II (NJ, NY, PA): Sandra Latourelle, 409 Rugar, Plattsburgh, NY 12901-3109
Region III (IL, IN, MI, OH, WI): Carl Koch, Riverside Brookfield H.S., 160 Ridgewood Rd., Riverside, IL 60546
Region IV (IA, KS, MN, MO, NE, ND, SD): Eugene ("Gene") R. Bormann, PO Box 68, Mission Hill, SD 57046
Region V (DE, DC, KY, MD, NC, SC, TN, VA, WV): Rebecca Ross, 2520 Nottingham Rd. SE, Roanoke, VA 24014
Region VI (AL, FL, GA, LA, MS, PR): Cissy Bennett, 21 Clarendon Rd., Birmingham, AL 35213
Region VII (AZ, AR, NM, OK, TX): Carole Anne Barsaloux, Edmond Public Schools, Administration Center, 1001 W. Danforth Rd., Edmond, OK 73003
Region VIII (CO, ID, MT, NV, UT, WY): Louisa A. Stark, University of Utah, Genetic Science Learning Center, 15 North 2030 East, Salt Lake City, UT 84112-5330
Region IX (AK, CA, HI, OR, WA, Pacific Territories): Alonda Droege, 11534 28th Ave. SW, Seattle, WA 98146
Region X (Canadian Provinces): Robert Malyk, Ridley College, P.O. Box 3013, #2 Ridley Rd., St. Catharines, Ontario, Canada L2R 7C3

Letters

The Myth of the "Biogenetic Law"

Dear Editor:

The recent article, "Haeckel's Embryos and Evolution" (Wells, *ABT*, May 1999), is a timely reminder that significant parts of Haeckel's diagrams of embryos were forged, as Haeckel himself publicly admitted in a letter to the *Berliner Volkszeitung* on 29th December 1908 (Assmuth & Hall 1918). In fact nowadays, for young biology students, it is more relevant to introduce Haeckel and his "biogenetic law" as one of the worst examples of scientific fraud, the consequences of which can still be detected, particularly in the fields of human embryology and molecular biology (Freeman 1987). Indeed, it is remarkable how major contemporary textbooks continue to reproduce Haeckel's forgeries and thereby perpetuate the myth of the "biogenetic law" (e.g. Alberts et al. 1994, p. 33, p. 1049).

Even the subsequent letter to your journal (Sonleitner, *ABT*, September 1999), criticizing the May article, persists with the erroneous terminology of "branchial" (i.e. gill) arches for a mammalian embryo. Here I am not merely nit-picking over terminology: when our language is based on fraudulent concepts, then our thinking is clouded and a discipline cannot progress. For example, extensive studies of early human embryos (Blechs Schmidt 1978) have shown that the folds on the ventral side of the embryo's head-neck region have nothing whatsoever to do with gills; the same applies to the chick and pig embryo. They are simple biomechanical flexion folds, caused by the embryo's head growing around the heart to which the neural tube is anchored biophysically via tension-bearing blood vessels. Such folds occur throughout life on the flexion side of all bends in the body, no matter whether the body belongs to an embryo or an adult. To retain the generic term "branchial" for the head folds of all embryos is to conceal the special nature of the folding in any one animal.

Today, all we need to know of Haeckel's "law" is that it is false and that it cannot be rescued by subtle rewording, or by claims that it is only partially true. Once this mental straightjacket is cast aside, along with its inaccurate concepts and terminology, it is possible to open our students' minds to the unique ontogeny of each species, and to recast evolution in a totally different and exciting framework.

Yours faithfully,

Brian Freeman

Senior Lecturer in Anatomy

UNSW

Sydney, NSW, Australia 2038

b.freeman@unsw.edu.au

References

- Alberts, B., Bray, D., Lewis, J., Raff, M., Roberts, K. & Watson, J.D. (1994). *Molecular Biology of the Cell* (3rd ed.). New York: Garland Publishing.
- Assmuth, J. & Hull, E.R. (1918). *Haeckel's Frauds and Forgeries*. Bombay: Examiner Press.
- Blechs Schmidt, E. (1978). *Anatomie und Ontogenese des Menschen*. Heidelberg: Quelle & Meyer Verlag.
- Freeman, B. (1987). Zur Diskussion. *Naturwissenschaften*, 74, 348.